

MINUTES

**Historic Preservation Commission Special Meeting
1st Floor Community Development Conference Room
May 5, 2004
5:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: B. J. Gonzales, Vice-Chair
Cathy Johnson
George Hartz
Nancy Dallett
Paul Winslow
Kathy Howard (5:20)

Absent: Edward Wimmer, Chairman

Staff: Debbie Abele
Don Meserve
Bob Cafarella
Cathy Eley

Visitors: Scott Lyon, Bill Nassikas, Ken Allen, Mike Levy, John Brooks, Mische O'Reilly, Robert Mansolillo, and Brian (last name unreadable on sign-in sheet)

PUBLIC HEARING/ACTION ITEMS – 2 –HP-2004 & 7-ZN-2002#3

2-HP-2004 and 7-ZN-2002#3

(Hotel Valley Ho Historic Preservation Plan and Development Standards Amendment) - request by Scott Lyon, MSR Properties LLC, owner/applicant, to approve an amendment to the Historic Preservation Plan for the Hotel Valley Ho and to amend the building height development standard, on an 8.86± acre parcel located on the north side of East Main Street alignment, between 68th and 69th Streets, at 6850 E. Main Street, zoned Highway Commercial, Downtown Overlay, Historic Property (C-3 DO HP). The request is to amend the development standard for building height for the tower element. The Historic Preservation Plan is required for each property zoned Historic Property (HP) overlay, and the text for this plan contains, but is not limited to, character defining features of the historic buildings, design guidelines, amended development standards, and financial incentives.

Ms. Abele reviewed with the Commission the order in which this item would be presented: staff would present their report to the Commission, the applicant would then make a presentation, the Commission would then be allowed to ask questions, public comments would be taken, staff would then conclude and make their recommendations and/or closing comments, the Commission would then discuss their action to approve, deny or continue this case and the reason.

Staff Report - Ms. Abele reviewed with the Commission the staff report on 2-HP-2004 & 7-ZN-2002#3 mailed to the Commission in the packets. Ms. Abele stated that this request was to revisit one small portion of the Historic Preservation Plan as it related to the amended development standards on page 10, Section

5.14D, building height for the tower element. The applicant is requesting to add an additional seven feet, or one story, to the tower element. Ms. Abele noted that this height amendment is based on the denial from the National Parks Service for eligibility for the Tax Credit.

Applicant Presentation - Mr. Lyon, applicant, stated that the height amendment is only for the hotel tower component. Mr. Lyon noted that the downtown zoning allows for 65' building height for commercial buildings and 72' for hotels. Mr. Lyon commented that their application to the National Parks Service for the Tax credit was denied on several fronts; all but one were easy fixes. The problem that they could not overcome on the design was the determination that any new additions not change the character of building. The additional stories above the lobby, bar and restaurant, as originally included in the 1956 plans, was denied at the federal level. The denial made the project ineligible for the federal tax credit of 20% of the costs of rehabilitating the historic hotel, which equates to approximately \$4.5 million.

Mr. Lyon noted that they were on the Planning Commission's agenda for May 12, 2004 and then City Council on May 17, 2004, with the hopes of starting construction in June. They feel that this amendment to add one additional level in the tower is the only way to stay on the current schedule.

Commission Questions - Commissioner Hartz asked if the height of the tower was 72 feet, would the height of the stairs and elevator be higher.

Ken Allen, Allen + Philp Architects responded that the height of the elevator tower would be 86 feet and the height of the stairs would be 89 feet, based on the exceptions to the maximum height in the ordinance.

Ms. Abele noted that the Commission was only considering a request for the additional 7-foot height on the tower building, and no other changes to the approved Hotel Valley Ho Historic Preservation Plan.

Commissioner Johnson asked how the condominiums would be held to the standards of the Historic Preservation Plan, since they were planned to be individually owned.

Mr. Allen responded that the ownership was subject to a rental agreement with the hotel, with strict controls on any changes to the condominiums.

Public Comments - Mr. Michael Levy, 3846 N. Pueblo Way, expressed his support of this project, noting that it would be a betterment for the neighborhood.

Staff Recommendation - Ms. Abele stated that staff is recommending approval of the amendment, noting that much discussion and planning went into the Historic Preservation Plan for this project, trying to take into consideration every possibility. Ms. Abele stated that staff feels that the additional 7 feet does not substantially impact the character of the project that has already been approved.

Commission Discussion - Vice-Chair Gonzales commented that architecturally it does not impact the structure in any way.

Commissioner Winslow noted that the existing property has a certain character that this project is trying to preserve and that by locating this tower height in the middle of the project, it minimizes the impact to the casual observer, and that the additional height was logical to make the project economically viable.

Commissioner Johnson commented that it was a good project that will help the Downtown and preserve the historic hotel.

Vice-Chair Gonzales asked what height was proposed on the property to the south.

Mr. Lyon stated that this property, on the south side of Main Street alignment, was under contract to sell so Westroc would not be developing the property. The proposed buildings in this project in the pending zoning case could be from 36 feet high to 65 feet high.

Commissioner Dallett commented that the additional height preserves the intention of the Historic Preservation Plan.

Commissioner Johnson commented that she would like to revisit the Historic Preservation Plan and review the wording changes that may be needed based on this amendment.

Ms. Abele responded that the Commission could change the wording in the plan at any time but that the requested amended development standard for height must be approved by City Council as a zoning case.

MOTION WAS MADE by Commissioner Hartz TO APPROVE THE AMENDMENT TO THE HOTEL VALLEY HO PRESERVATION PLAN, THE DEVELOPMENT STANDARD SECTION TO INCREASE THE ALLOWABLE HEIGHT FROM 65 FEET TO 72 FEET AND AMENDING THE C-3 AND DO HEIGHT GUIDELINES TO SIMILARLY BE 72 FEET FOR THE TOWER BUILDING AS SHOWN ON THE COMPOSITE SITE PLAN THAT HAS BEEN SUBMITTED. THIS AMENDMENT SUPPORTS BOTH THE ECONOMIC FEASIBILITY OF THIS IMPORTANT PROJECT WHILE MAINTAINING THE CHARACTERISTICS THAT WE FOUND ESSENTIAL FOR APPROVAL TO PLACE ON THE HISTORIC REGISTER. MOTION WAS SECONDED by Commissioner Winslow, WHICH CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY, 6-0.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENTS

Commissioner Harts stated that there would be an Education Outreach meeting on May 10, 2004 at 5:15 PM in the 3rd Floor conference room.

Mr. Meserve distributed a memo answering questions raised by the Commission at the previous meeting, noting that an open house on one of the topics was scheduled for May 11, 2004.

Commissioner Howard noted that there would be no Historic Register Committee meeting on May 12, 2004 because of the Planning Commission hearing. The next meeting was scheduled on June 9, 2004.

Mr. Meserve noted that the Pink Pony and Sugar Bowl HP designations were approved by City Council last night, May 4, 2004, so the two properties are now on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

FUTURE MEETINGS/AGENDA ITEMS

There were none. The next regular meeting is on May 13, 2004.

Meeting adjourned at 5:45 P.M.

Submitted by:

Cathy Eley
Recording Secretary

Agdmin/5504min